## Holography & quasinormal modes - tools for strongly coupled far from equilibrium dynamics

Bangtao Beach Resort & Spa, Phuket, NonEquilibrium Dynamics 2016 04 November 2016



Matthias Kaminski University of Alabama



B

Matthias Kaminski

## **Example: Chiral hydrodynamics**



Matthias Kaminski

Which are the relevant quantities in systems far from equilibrium, and how can we predict their behavior?



Which are the relevant quantities in systems far from equilibrium, and how can we predict their behavior?

#### Hydrodynamics -near equilibrium

is an effective description of systems at late times / large distances.

$$T(t, \vec{x}), \, \mu(t, \vec{x}), \, u^{\nu}(t, \vec{x})$$

hydrodynamic fields -protected by symmetries, hence they survive





Which are the relevant quantities in systems far from equilibrium, and how can we predict their behavior?

#### Hydrodynamics -near equilibrium

is an effective description of systems at late times / large distances.





Matthias Kaminski

Which are the relevant quantities in systems far from equilibrium, and how can we predict their behavior?

#### Hydrodynamics -near equilibrium

is an effective description of systems at late times / large distances.

$$j^{\mu} = nu^{\mu} + \sigma E^{\mu} + \dots$$

conserved current is a good observable (ideal) charge flow

conductivity term





Which are the relevant quantities in systems far from equilibrium, and how can we predict their behavior?

Hydrodynamics -near equilibrium

is an effective description of systems at late times / large distances.

$$j^{\mu} = nu^{\mu} + \sigma E^{\mu} + \dots$$

conserved current is a good observable (ideal) charge flow

conductivity term





## Contents

- I. Near and far from equilibrium
- 2. Quasi-normal modes (QNMs)
- 3. Results
- 4. Discussion



## Near and far-from equilibrium - heavy ion collision

Example 1: Off-center collision



color coding: energy density = high density red blue = low density





Matthias Kaminski

## Holography far-from equilibrium



## Holographic plasma thermalization results



## **Gravitational waves in AdS**

Gravitational waves are similar to waves in a pond:



waves on spacetime solutions to linearized Einstein equation



waves on water solutions to wave equation



Matthias Kaminski

## Heuristically: What are quasi-normal modes?

• heuristically: the eigenmodes of black holes or black branes



• formal definition: (metric) fluctuations that are in-falling at horizon and vanishing at AdS-boundary



• correspond to poles of correlators in dual field theory

[Kovtun, Starinets; JHEP 2005]

• example: tensor fluctuations (known from shear viscosity bound) QNMs of  $\phi := h_x^{\ y}$  are poles of  $\langle T_{xy} T_{xy} \rangle$ [Policastro, Son, Starinets; JHEP 2002]

[Kovtun, Son, Starinets; 2004]



black

hole

## 2. Quasi-normal modes (QNMs)





Matthias Kaminski

## What do quasi-normal modes mean?



$$h_{xy}(t) \propto e^{-i\omega t} h_{xy}(\omega)$$

$$e^{-i\omega t} = e^{-i(\operatorname{Re}\omega)t}e^{(\operatorname{Im}\omega)t}$$

resonance frequency (mass of the associated quasiparticle) damping (decay width of the quasiparticle)



Matthias Kaminski

## What do quasi-normal modes mean?



QNMs of 
$$\phi:={h_x}^y$$
 are poles of  $\langle T_{xy}\,T_{xy}
angle$ 

Fourier transformation of gravity field:

$$h_{xy}(t) \propto e^{-i\omega t} h_{xy}(\omega)$$

Resonance and decay are encoded in QNM frequency:

$$e^{-i\omega t} = e^{-i(\operatorname{Re}\omega)t}e^{(\operatorname{Im}\omega)t}$$

resonance frequency (mass of the associated quasiparticle) damping (decay width of the quasiparticle)



Matthias Kaminski

## Far beyond hydrodynamics : **QNMs**

Example: 3+1-dimensional N=4 Super-Yang-Mills theory; poles of  $\langle T_{xy}T_{xy}\rangle(\omega,k) = G_{xy,xy}^R(\omega,k) = -i\int d^4x \ e^{-i\omega t + ikz}\langle [T_{xy}(z),T_{xy}(0)]\rangle$ 





Matthias Kaminski

## Method: how to compute QNMs

• start with any **gravitational background** (metric, matter content)

• choose one or more **fields to fluctuate** (obeying linearized Einstein equations; Fourier transformed  $\phi(t) \propto e^{-i\omega t}\phi(\omega)$ )

• impose **boundary conditions** that are in-falling at horizon:

and vanishing at AdS-boundary:



Matthias Kaminski

## Method: how to compute QNMs

start with any gravitational background (metric, matter content)
 *Example:* (charged) Reissner-Nordstrom black brane in 5-dim AdS

$$ds^2 = rac{r^2}{L^2} \left( -fdt^2 + dec{x}^2 
ight) + rac{L^2}{r^2 f} dr^2 \qquad f(r) = 1 - rac{mL^2}{r^4} + rac{q^2 L^2}{r^6} \ A_t = \mu - rac{Q}{Lr^2}$$

• choose one or more **fields to fluctuate** (obeying linearized Einstein equations; Fourier transformed  $\phi(t) \propto e^{-i\omega t} \phi(\omega)$ ) *Example:* metric tensor fluctuation

$$\phi := h_x^y \qquad 0 = \phi'' - \frac{f(u) - u f'(u)}{u f(u)} \phi' + \frac{\omega^2 - f(u)k^2}{4r_H^2 u f(u)^2} \phi$$

$$u = \left(\frac{r_H}{r}\right)^2$$
so se **boundary conditions** that are

• impose **boundary conditions** that are in-falling at horizon:  $\phi = (1-u)^{\pm \frac{i\tilde{\omega}}{2(2-\tilde{q}^2)}} \left[ \phi^{(0)} + \phi^{(1)}(1-u) + \phi^{(2)}(1-u)^2 + \dots \right]$ and

and

vanishing at AdS-boundary:  $\lim_{r \to r_{bdy}} \phi(r) = 0$ 



Matthias Kaminski

#### Physical question: What is the equilibrium state of a theory with chiral current + external magnetic field ?



Matthias Kaminski

## Hydro of theory with chiral current + external field

Constitutive relations:

$$J^{\mu} = J^{\mu}(T, \mu, u^{\alpha}; g_{\alpha\beta}, A_{\alpha})$$
$$T^{\mu\nu} = T^{\mu\nu}(T, \mu, u^{\alpha}; g_{\alpha\beta}, A_{\alpha})$$



Conservation equations:

$$\partial_{\mu}J^{\mu} = C F \wedge F$$
$$\partial_{\mu}T^{\mu\nu} = F^{\nu\mu}J_{\mu}$$

Choose external fields:



Matthias Kaminski

$$A_{\alpha} = \delta_{t,\alpha} \mu(z) + \frac{B}{2} (x \delta_{y,\alpha} - y \delta_{x,\alpha})$$
$$g_{\alpha\beta} = \begin{pmatrix} -1 & 0 & 0 & 0\\ 0 & 1 & 0 & 0\\ 0 & 0 & 1 & 0\\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix}$$

# Equilibrium with chiral anomaly + magnetic field Trick:\* $\partial_{\mu}J^{\mu} = CF \wedge F$ $\sim C \,\epsilon^{\alpha\beta\gamma\delta} F_{\alpha\beta}F_{\gamma\delta}$ $\partial_z J^z \sim \tilde{C} \, \epsilon^{ztxy} \left( \partial_z A_t(z) \right) B$ $ik_z J^z \sim \tilde{C} \quad (ik_z A_t(z)) B$

make gauge field constant in z, and call it `chemical potential'

 $\Rightarrow J^z \sim \tilde{C} \mu B$ 

"vacuum" charge current

\*Thanks to Martin Ammon.



Matthias Kaminski

Equilibrium with chiral anomaly + magnetic field  

$$Trick:^{*} \partial_{\mu}J^{\mu} = C F \wedge F$$

$$\sim C \epsilon^{\alpha\beta\gamma\delta} F_{\alpha\beta}F_{\gamma\delta}$$

$$\partial_{z}J^{z} \sim \tilde{C} \epsilon^{ztxy} (\partial_{z}A_{t}(z)) B$$

$$ik_{z}J^{z} \sim \tilde{C} \quad (ik_{z}A_{t}(z)) B$$

$$make gauge field constant in z, and call it `chemical potential' \Rightarrow \int^{z} \sim \tilde{C} \mu B$$

$$``uccuum'' charge current$$

$$\partial_{\mu}T^{\mu\nu} = F^{\nu\mu}J_{\mu} \Rightarrow \int^{zt} \sim \tilde{C}\mu^{2}B$$

$$``uccuum'' heat current$$

$$Tanks to Martin Ammon.$$

🧷 Matthias Kaminski

## Equilibrium with chiral anomaly + magnetic field

Trick:\* 
$$\partial_{\mu}J^{\mu} = C F \wedge F$$

make gauge field constant in z, and call it `chemical potential'  $= C \, \epsilon^{\alpha\beta\gamma\delta} \, F_{\alpha\beta} F_{\gamma\delta}$ 

$$\partial_z J^z = \tilde{C} \, \epsilon^{ztxy} \left( \partial_z \mu \right) B$$
$$= 0$$

$$\partial_{\mu}T^{\mu\nu} = F^{\nu\mu}J_{\nu} \Rightarrow$$



same state variables, but different result !?



Matthias Kaminski

#### **Discrepancy - What now?**



versus

 $J^z \sim \tilde{C} \mu B$  "vacuum" charge current

 $T^{zt}\sim { ilde C}\mu^2 B$  "vacuum" heat current



#### **Discrepancy - What now?**



**TEST:** Perform a calculation in a holographic model

$$S_{gravity} = \left[\int d^5x \sqrt{-g}(R-2\Lambda) - \frac{1}{4}F^2) + \frac{C}{6}\int A \wedge F \wedge F\right]$$



Matthias Kaminski

#### **Discrepancy - What now?**



**TEST:** Perform a calculation in a holographic model

$$S_{gravity} = \left[\int d^5x \sqrt{-g}(R-2\Lambda) - \frac{1}{4}F^2) + \frac{C}{6}\int A \wedge F \wedge F\right]$$





Matthias Kaminski

## Equilibrium with chiral anomaly + magnetic field

 $J^z \sim \tilde{C} \mu B$  "vacuum" charge current  $T^{zt} \sim \tilde{C} \mu^2 B$  "vacuum" heat current

If we have a chiral anomaly and an external magnetic field, then there are two currents in equilibrium: (i) The heat current (ii) The (axial) charge current



Matthias Kaminski





Matthias Kaminski



#### Follow Pavel Kovtun's systematic work:

Thermodynamics of polarized relativistic matter [Kovtun; JHEP (2016)]

 $T^{\mu\nu} = Pg^{\mu\nu} + (Ts + \mu\rho)u^{\mu}u^{\nu} + T^{\mu\nu}_{\rm EM}$ 

 $T^{\mu\nu}_{\rm EM} = M^{\mu\alpha}g_{\alpha\beta}F^{\beta\nu} + u^{\mu}u^{\alpha}\left(M_{\alpha\beta}F^{\beta\nu} - F_{\alpha\beta}M^{\beta\nu}\right) \quad [\text{Israel; Gen Relat Gravit (1978)}]$ 





#### Follow Pavel Kovtun's systematic work:

Thermodynamics of polarized relativistic matter [Kovtun; JHEP (2016)]

$$T^{\mu\nu} = Pg^{\mu\nu} + (Ts + \mu\rho)u^{\mu}u^{\nu} + T^{\mu\nu}_{\rm EM}$$
$$T^{\mu\nu}_{\rm EM} = M^{\mu\alpha}g_{\alpha\beta}F^{\beta\nu} + u^{\mu}u^{\alpha}\left(M_{\alpha\beta}F^{\beta\nu} - F_{\alpha\beta}M^{\beta\nu}\right) \quad [Israel; Gen Relat Gravit (1978)]$$

$$p^{\lambda} = \chi_{\rm EE}E^{\lambda} + \chi_{\rm EB}B^{\lambda} + \chi_{\rm EO}\Omega^{\lambda} + \chi_{\rm ES}S^{\lambda} \qquad m^{\lambda} = \chi_{\rm III}B^{\lambda} + \chi_{\rm III}\Omega^{\lambda} + \chi_{\rm III}S^{\lambda} + \chi_{\rm III}$$



Matthias Kaminski



#### Follow Pavel Kovtun's systematic work:

Thermodynamics of polarized relativistic matter [Kovtun; JHEP (2016)]

$$T^{\alpha\beta} = \begin{pmatrix} \epsilon & 0 & 0 & \frac{C}{2}\mu^2 B \\ 0 & P - \chi_{BB}\frac{\partial P}{\partial B} & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & P - \chi_{BB}\frac{\partial P}{\partial B} & 0 \\ \frac{C}{2}\mu^2 B & 0 & 0 & P \end{pmatrix}$$
$$J^{\alpha} = \begin{pmatrix} n \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ C\mu B \end{pmatrix} \qquad \begin{array}{c} \text{thermodynamics to} \\ \text{zeroth order in derivatives} \\ \text{with only magnetic field} \\ (agrees with holographic model) \end{array}$$



Matthias Kaminski

## 3. Results: QNMs of charged magnetic branes

holographic dual ...

$$S_{gravity} = \left[ \int d^5 x \sqrt{-g} (R - 2\Lambda) - \frac{1}{4} F^2 \right] + \frac{C}{6} \int A \wedge F \wedge F \right]$$

... of a particular charged magnetic plasma in presence of a chiral anomaly



Matthias Kaminski

## **Result: tensor QNMs of RN black brane**

Equilibrium solution

[Janiszewski, Kaminski; PRD (2015)]

Reissner-Nordstrom (charged) black branes in 5-dim AdS





Less stable resonances at larger charges. Equilibration happens faster. Agreement with far from equilibrium setup at late times, deviation <1%

Matthias Kaminski

## **Result: Imaginary QNMs**

[Janiszewski, Kaminski; PRD (2015)]

Re ω





lin e

Matthias Kaminski

## **Result: tensor QNMs of magnetic black brane**





Matthias Kaminski

## **Result: scalar QNMs of magnetic black brane**



Agreement with far from equilibrium setup at late times: ~10% cf. [Fuini, Yaffe; (2015)]

Matthias Kaminski

#### Hydrodynamic result: dispersion relations changed

[Ammon, Leiber, Kaminski, Koirala, Wu; in progress]

holographic calculation and hydrodynamic calculation agree that dispersion relations are changed for the hydrodynamic poles by

• chiral anomaly coefficient



## My question to all participants: What can we do with this holographic model and with this hydrodynamics (with chiral anomaly and external fields)?



## Summary

- translate a QFT problem into a (classical) gravity problem
- fast thermalization
- fast hydrolization
- quasinormal modes
  - "lowest QNM" describes holographic thermalization early on
    QNM" changes with charge and magnetic field
    hydrodynamic QNMs match hydro prediction
    QNMs go far beyond hydrodynamic regime
- dispersion relations for hydro poles changed
- Outlook: construct effective description far from equilibrium (chiral transport in HIC)



## **APPENDIX**



Matthias Kaminski

### Magnetic black brane thermodynamics

Magnetic black branes

- magnetic analog of RN black brane
- Asymptotically AdS5
- AdS5 near horizon

Ansatz

breaks rotational invariance from SO(3) in *x*, *y*, *z* to SO(2) in *x*, *y* plane (*xx-zz* is a scalar now!)

$$egin{aligned} ds^2 &= -U(r)dt^2 + rac{dr^2}{U(r)} + e^{2V(r)}(dx^2 + dy^2) + e^{2W(r)}dz^2\,, \ F &= bdx \wedge dy\,. \end{aligned}$$



[D'Hoker, Kraus; JHEP (2009)]

#### Magnetic black brane thermodynamics

Magnetic black branes

- magnetic analog of RN black brane
- Asymptotically AdS5
- AdS5 near horizon

breaks rotational invariance from SO(3) in *x*, *y*, *z* to SO(2) in *x*, *y* plane (*xx-zz* is a scalar now!)

$$egin{aligned} ds^2 &= -U(r)dt^2 + rac{dr^2}{U(r)} + e^{2V(r)}(dx^2 + dy^2) + e^{2W(r)}dz^2\,, \ F &= bdx \wedge dy\,. \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} 0 &= 2b^{2} + 4e^{4V(u)} \left( u^{3}\tilde{U}'(u)(2V'(u) + W'(u)) + u^{2}\tilde{U}(u)(2(u(2V''(u) + W'(u)) + W'(u)^{2}) + V'(u)(2uW'(u) + 3) + 3uV'(u)^{2}) + 3W'(u)) - 3 \right), \\ 0 &= 2u^{2}e^{4V(u)}(2u\tilde{U}''(u) + \tilde{U}'(u)(4u(V'(u) + W'(u)) + 3) + \tilde{U}(u)(4u(V''(u) + W''(u) + W''(u)^{2}) + V'(u)(4uW'(u) + 6) + 4uV'(u)^{2} + 6W'(u))) - 2(b^{2} + 6e^{4V(u)}), \\ 0 &= b^{2}e^{-4V(u)} + u^{2}(2(u\tilde{U}''(u) + V'(u)(4uW'(u) + 6) + 4uV'(u)^{2} + 6W'(u))) - 2(b^{2} + 6e^{4V(u)}), \\ 0 &= b^{2}e^{-4V(u)} + u^{2}(2(u\tilde{U}''(u) + V'(u) + 1))) + \tilde{U}'(u)(8uV'(u) + 3)) - 6, \\ 0 &= b^{2}e^{-4V(u)} + 2u^{3}(\tilde{U}'(u)(2V'(u) + W'(u)) + 2\tilde{U}(u)V'(u)(V'(u) + 2W'(u))) - 6. \end{aligned}$$



Matthias Kaminski

#### Holography & quasinormal modes

[D'Hoker, Kraus; JHEP (2009)]

#### Magnetic black brane thermodynamics

Magnetic black branes

- magnetic analog of RN black brane
- Asymptotically AdS5
- AdS5 near horizon

Ansatz

breaks rotational invariance from SO(3) in *x*, *y*, *z* to SO(2) in *x*, *y* plane (*xx-zz* is a scalar now!)

[D'Hoker, Kraus; JHEP (2009)]

$$egin{aligned} ds^2 &= -U(r)dt^2 + rac{dr^2}{U(r)} + e^{2V(r)}(dx^2 + dy^2) + e^{2W(r)}dz^2 \ F &= bdx \wedge dy \,. \end{aligned}$$



Matthias Kaminski

## **Holography concepts**





Matthias Kaminski

## **Gauge/Gravity concepts**

The Gauge/Gravity correspondence is basedon the holographic principle.['t Hooft (1993)] $S_{max}$  (volume)  $\propto$  surface areaString theory gives one example (AdS/CFT).N=4 Super-Yang-MillsTyp II B Supergravityin 3+1 dimensionsTyp II B Supergravity[Susskind (1995)]in (4+1)-dimensional(Maldacena (1997)]

Anti de Sitter space (AdS)

ternium Marbenneside Project

(CFT)





Matthias Kaminski

## **Equilibrium states**









Matthias Kaminski

## **Equilibrium states**

correspondence strongly coupled weakly curved quantum field theory gravitational theory (QFT) renormalization scale  $\leftarrow$ radial AdS coordinate **QFT** temperature Hawking temperature charged black hole/brane conserved charge radial AdS boundary of coordinate Anti de Sitter space black



Matthias Kaminski

## Example: Reissner-Nordström black brane

N=4 Super-Yang-Mills correspondence metric & gauge field theory at nonzero brane (solve Einsteintemperature & charge. Maxwell eq's) metric:  $ds^2 = \frac{r^2}{L^2} \left( -fdt^2 + d\vec{x}^2 \right) + \frac{L^2}{r^2 f} dr^2$  $T = r_H^2 \frac{|f'(r_H)|}{4\pi}$  $f(r) = 1 - \frac{mL^2}{r^4} + \frac{q^2L^2}{r^6}$ gauge field: radial AdS  $A_t = \mu - \frac{Q}{Lr^2}$ coordinate  $\mu = \frac{\sqrt{3q}}{2r_{-}^2}$ 



Matthias Kaminski

## Example: Reissner-Nordström black brane

N=4 Super-Yang-Mills correspondence metric & gauge field theory at nonzero brane (solve Einsteințemperature & charge/ Maxwell eq's) QFT temperature:  $\longleftarrow$  metric:  $ds^2 = \frac{r^2}{L^2} \left( -fdt^2 + d\vec{x}^2 \right) + \frac{L^2}{r^2 f} dr^2$  $T = r_H^2 \frac{|f'(r_H)|}{4\pi}$  $f(r) = 1 - \frac{mL^2}{m^4} + \frac{q^2L^2}{m^6}$ conserved charge  $Q, \blacktriangleleft$ gauge field: radial AdS thermodynamically  $A_t = \mu - \frac{Q}{I r^2}$ coordinate dual to chemical  $\mu = \frac{\sqrt{3q}}{2r_{\mathrm{Tr}}^2}$ black potential: hole



Matthias Kaminski

Holography & quasinormal modes

Page 37



Matthias Kamins

Holography & quasinormal modes

Page 38